



Faculty of Economics and Business

**The Impact of Value Co-creation Behaviour on Brand Equity of Pakistan
Banking Sector: The Moderating Role of Social Media**

Ejaz Ahmed

**Doctor of Philosophy
2024**

The Impact of Value Co-creation Behaviour on Brand Equity of Pakistan
Banking Sector: The Moderating Role of Social Media

Ejaz Ahmed

A thesis submitted

In fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

(Marketing)

Faculty of Economics and Business
UNIVERSITI MALAYSIA SARAWAK

2024

DECLARATION

I declare that the work in this thesis was carried out in accordance with the regulations of Universiti Malaysia Sarawak. Except where due acknowledgements have been made, the work is that of the author alone. The thesis has not been accepted for any degree and is not concurrently submitted in candidature of any other degree.



.....

Signature

Name: Ejaz Ahmed

Matric No.: 20010177

Faculty of Economics and Business

Universiti Malaysia Sarawak

Date: 6th May, 2024

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

Allah Subhana Tala gives us the autonomy to explore the universe and determine the truth. Firstly, I express my gratitude to Allah Subhana Tala for granting me the chance to make a meaningful contribution to the improvement of humanity through my Ph.D. I am deeply grateful to my entire family, particularly my parents (my deceased mother), my spouse, and my children, whose sacrifices, prayers, and unwavering support boosted me to the finale of my thesis.

I am really grateful to my respected supervisor, Dr. Harry Ak Entebang (Associate Professor), for his valuable guidance, mentorship, and ongoing input, which have greatly enhanced my enthusiasm and knowledge throughout this journey. His mentorship helped me to conduct extensive research and write this thesis. I am grateful to my co-supervisors, Dr. Sin Kit Yeng and Dr. Sharizal Bin Hashim, for their valuable contributions to my thesis writing in the form of honest feedback.

This journey would not be as productive without the support and assistance of my affectionate, supportive, kind, and naughty friends (Dr. Mubashir Ali Khan and Dr. Irfan Sabir). As a result, I am immensely grateful to all of my friends. Lastly, I would like to express my gratitude to the administration of Universiti Malaysia Sarawak for facilitating my academic journey in Sarawak. I extend my appreciation to each and every one of you.

ABSTRACT

The importance of brand equity in branding and marketing has led researchers and industry specialists to investigate its model and evaluation. There is a lack of studies on the brand equity of service and banking industries in emerging economies. It is atypical for banks to be devoid of branding study. Evaluating a service prior to purchasing or using it can be challenging, and it sometimes requires a significant amount of effort to authenticate the claims made by the company. One may also resort to leveraging social media platforms to gather feedback from family, friends, and groups regarding specific products or services. Many brand equity studies conducted in affluent nations have yielded positive results, indicating the need for a concentrated effort on emerging countries in the same region. Brand equity data is limited in the service industry, particularly in the banking sector, especially in emerging countries such as Pakistan. This study employs Aaker's model dimensions to evaluate the brand equity of banks in Pakistan. A total of 426 banking users from Lahore were surveyed in person to gather data based on non-probability by following purposive technique. Lahore is the capital of Punjab, the second-largest city in terms of population, and also houses the second largest stock market. PLS-SEM was employed to assess the adequacy of the model by examining both the measurement model and structural equation modeling. The study demonstrates that customer participation behaviour (CPB) and citizenship behaviour (CCB) enhance brand equity. Social media serves as a mediator and enhances the value of a brand. Social media platforms also have a favourable impact on the relationship between customer participation behaviour (CPB) and brand equity (BE), ultimately strengthening brand equity. Nevertheless, it does not enhance the links between CCB and BE. The primary cause is the proliferation of counterfeit, inaccurate, and manipulated

material and comments on websites, blogs, and comment sections. It is imperative for all banks to provide utmost importance to internal branding, services, security, and privacy, as well as external consumers. This is for the reason that the service encounter is a critical moment that determines the value of the brand. Stakeholder encouragement should be given priority by top management, as it directly represents the brand values through customer service. The majority of Pakistani banks provide internet banking services, although the survey participants refrain from using it due to a lack of trust. Therefore, it is imperative for the majority of Pakistani banks to collaborate with the State Bank of Pakistan (SBP) in order to establish and enhance the trustworthiness of internet banking. Enhancements in service, client satisfaction, and brand equity are observed.

Keywords: Banking sector, Brand equity, Emerging markets, Service brand equity, Service sector

*Kesan Kelakuan Penciptaan Bersama Nilai terhadap Ekuiti Jenama Sektor Perbankan
Pakistan: Peranan Penyederhana Media Sosial*

ABSTRAK

Kepentingan ekuiti jenama dalam penjenamaan dan pemasaran telah menyebabkan penyelidik dan pakar industri menyasat model dan penilaiannya. Terdapat kekurangan kajian mengenai ekuiti jenama perkhidmatan dan industri perbankan dalam ekonomi sedang pesat membangun. Adalah tidak tipikal bagi bank untuk tidak mempunyai kajian penjenamaan. Menilai perkhidmatan sebelum membeli atau menggunakannya boleh menjadi mencabar, dan kadangkala memerlukan usaha yang besar untuk mengesahkan tuntutan yang dibuat oleh syarikat. Seseorang juga boleh menggunakan platform media sosial untuk mengumpulkan maklum balas daripada keluarga, rakan dan kumpulan mengenai produk atau perkhidmatan tertentu. Banyak kajian ekuiti jenama yang dijalankan di negara-negara kaya telah membuahkan hasil yang positif, menunjukkan keperluan untuk usaha tertumpu ke atas negara-negara membangun di rantau yang sama. Data ekuiti jenama adalah terhad dalam industri perkhidmatan, khususnya dalam sektor perbankan, terutamanya di negara-negara membangun seperti Pakistan. Kajian ini menggunakan dimensi model Aaker untuk menilai ekuiti jenama bank di Pakistan. Sejumlah 426 pengguna perbankan dari Lahore telah ditinjau secara peribadi untuk mengumpul data. Lahore ialah ibu kota Punjab, bandar kedua terbesar dari segi populasi, dan juga menempatkan pasaran saham. PLS-SEM digunakan untuk menilai kecukupan model dengan meneliti kedua-dua model pengukuran dan pemodelan persamaan struktur. Kajian menunjukkan bahawa tingkah laku penyertaan pelanggan (CPB) dan tingkah laku kewarganegaraan (CCB) meningkatkan ekuiti jenama. Media sosial berfungsi sebagai perantara dan meningkatkan

nilai sesuatu jenama. Platform media sosial juga mempunyai impak yang menggalakkan terhadap hubungan antara tingkah laku penyertaan pelanggan (CPB) dan ekuiti jenama (BE), yang akhirnya mengukuhkan ekuiti jenama. Namun begitu, ia tidak meningkatkan hubungan antara CCB dan BE. Punca utama ialah percambahan bahan dan ulasan palsu, tidak tepat dan dimanipulasi di tapak web, blog dan bahagian komen. Adalah mustahak bagi semua bank untuk memberikan kepentingan sepenuhnya kepada penjenamaan dalaman, perkhidmatan, keselamatan dan privasi, serta pengguna luar. Ini kerana pertemuan perkhidmatan adalah saat kritikal yang menentukan nilai jenama. Galakan pihak berkepentingan harus diberi keutamaan oleh pengurusan atasan, kerana ia secara langsung mewakili nilai jenama melalui perkhidmatan pelanggan. Majoriti bank Pakistan menyediakan perkhidmatan perbankan internet, walaupun peserta kaji selidik mengelak daripada menggunakannya kerana kurang kepercayaan. Oleh itu, adalah mustahak bagi majoriti bank Pakistan untuk bekerjasama dengan Bank Negara Pakistan (SBP) untuk mewujudkan dan meningkatkan kebolehpercayaan perbankan internet. Peningkatan dalam perkhidmatan, kepuasan pelanggan, dan ekuiti jenama diperhatikan.

Kata kunci: *Kata Kunci: Sektor Perbankan, Ekuiti Jenama, Pasaran Berkembang, Perkhidmatan Ekuiti Jenama, Sektor Perkhidmatan*

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
DECLARATION	i
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	ii
ABSTRACT	iii
ABSTRAK	v
TABLE OF CONTENTS	vii
LIST OF TABLES	xvi
LIST OF FIGURES	xviii
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xix
CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Research Background	1
1.2 Problem Statement	8
1.3 Banking sector growth and innovation in a global context	17
1.4 Research Questions	19
1.5 Research Objectives	19
1.6 Scope of Study	20
1.7 Significance of the Study	20
1.8 Theoretical Background of the Study	22

1.9	Practical and Contextual Implications of the Study	23
1.10	Chapter Summery	26
	CHAPTER 2 LITERATURE REVIEW	27
2.1	Introduction	27
2.2	Concept of Brand	28
2.2.1	History of Brand Equity	30
2.2.2	Aaker Model of Brand Equity	35
2.2.3	Key dimensions of Aaker brand equity model	35
2.4	Keller Model 1993 of brand equity	42
2.4.1	Customer Based Brand Equity Model	44
2.4.2	Criticism	49
2.4.3	Customer based brand equity and financial perspective	50
2.5	The Concept of “Value”	56
2.5.1	Value from the Marketing Point of View	58
2.6	The Concept of Co-creation	63
2.6.1	Three Types of Co-creation	65
2.6.2	Monetary value co-creation	66
2.6.3	The use or experience value of co-creation	66
2.6.4	Societal Value of Co-Creation	67
2.7	Value co-creation in Real Perspective	68

2.7.1	Mass Collaboration	68
2.7.2	Mass Customization	69
2.7.3	User-Generated or Created Content	69
2.7.4	Co-Producers/Creator	70
2.8	Utilization of Technology and Electronic Banking Services Adoption	74
2.8.1	Value co-creation in banking service perspectives	76
2.9	E-Banking Problems in Pakistan	77
2.9.1	Inquiry	78
2.9.2	Payment	78
2.9.3	Request	78
2.9.4	Download	78
2.9.5	Trust	79
2.9.6	Security	80
2.9.7	Insufficient awareness	81
2.9.8	Infrastructure	82
2.9.9	Information Technology (IT) Self-Efficacy	83
2.9.10	Management and Regulations	83
2.10	VCC and SM usage are becoming popular worldwide in banking industry	84
2.11	Users' roles in the development of new services in the banking sector	88
2.12	Pakistan's low bankerization levels in South Asia	91

2.13	Value co-creation needs in the Pakistani banking sector	95
2.14	Customer Participation behaviours	101
2.14.1	Information seeking	102
2.14.2	Information sharing	103
2.14.3	Responsible Behaviour	104
2.14.4	Personal interaction	104
2.15	The customer's citizenship behaviour	105
2.15.1	Feedback	108
2.15.2	Advocacy	109
2.15.3	Helping	109
2.15.4	Tolerance	110
2.16	Knowledge obtained from social media interactions	110
2.16.1	Brand innovation and social media relationships	111
2.17	Social media boosts brand innovation	113
2.18	Word of Mouth	114
2.19	New technological emergence (social media): WOM to E-WOM	115
2.20	Online communities and the impact of electronic word of mouth	117
2.21	Electronic Word of Mouth (EWOM)	119
2.21.1	The key drivers of electronic word-of-mouth marketing	119
2.22	Social media learning and brand strategy development to increase equity	122

2.23	The world's major banks' brand names improve	125
2.23.1	Chinese banks dominate the ranking	126
2.23.2	Continent Leaders	127
2.23.3	New entrants of Banks	128
2.24	Niche market leaders that aim for the top	128
2.25	Pakistan's banking sector	131
2.26	Social media and relationship marketing theory	134
2.27	Stakeholder Theory	138
2.28	Service-Dominant Logic	141
2.29	Integrating a Service-Based Worldview with Stakeholder Perspectives	143
2.30	Brand Equity Theory (Base Theory)	147
2.31	Social media influence on brand equity	148
2.32	Uses of Gratification Theory (supporting Theory)	149
2.33	Underpinning Theories within the Field	152
2.34	Hypotheses Development	153
2.35	Chapter Summary	157
	CHAPTER 3 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	159
3.1	Introduction	159
3.2	Research Philosophy	160
3.3	Research Design	162

3.4	Type of Study	163
3.5	Survey Design	164
3.6	Unit Analysis	165
3.7	Time Horizon	165
3.8	Population, Sample, and Sampling Technique	166
3.9	Population of the Study	166
3.10	Justification for the Selection of the Banking Industry	166
3.11	Sample Size	171
3.11.1	Sampling Technique	174
3.11.2	Justification for the Selection of Lahore	176
3.12	Questionnaire Development	180
3.13	Measurement of the Instrument	181
3.14	Customer Value Co-Creation Behaviour Scale (CPB and CCB)	183
3.15	Spent time on social media and E-WoM scale	183
3.16	Brand equity measurement scale	184
3.17	Pilot Study	184
3.18	Data Analysis Tools and Techniques	185
3.18.1:	Structural Equation Modeling (SEM)	186
3.18.2:	Software Selection for PLS-SEM	187
3.18.3:	Data Characteristics of PLS-SEM	189

3.18.4: Structural Equation Modeling Steps with PLS Path Modeling	190
3.18.5 Measurement Model Assessment: First Stage of SEM	191
3.18.6 Assessment of Reflective Measurement Model	194
3.18.7:Structural Model Assessment: Second Stage of SEM	196
3.19 Ethics	198
3.20 Chapter Summary	199
Chapter 4 DATA ANALYSIS AND RESULTS	201
4.1 Overview of the chapter	201
4.2: Data Collection Issues	203
4.2.1: Response Rate	203
4.2.2 Missing Data	204
4.2.3 Suspicious Response Patterns	205
4.2.4 Outliers	206
4.3 Data Distribution	207
4.4 Respondents' Demographic Profile	209
4.5 Descriptive Statistics	213
4.6 Correlations among Variables	214
4.7 Measurement Model Assessment	214
4.7.1 Evaluation of Reflective Measurement Models	215
4.7.1.1 Internal Consistency Reliability	215
4.7.1.2 Indicators' Reliability	217

4.7.1.3 Convergent Validity	220
4.7.1.4 Discriminant Validity	221
4.7.1.4.1 Fornell-Larcker Criterion	222
4.7.1.4.2 Heterotrait-Monotrait Ratio	223
4.8: Structural Model and Direct Hypothesis Testing	224
4.9: Coefficient of Determination (R ² Value)	225
4.10: Significance of Path Coefficients	227
4.11 Goodness of Fit (GOF)	231
4.12 Discussion on Hypothesis	233
4.12.1 H1: CPB Activities Positively Influence Brand Equity.	233
4.12.2 H2: CCB Activities positively influence Brand Equity	235
4.12.3 H3: Social Media (E-wom) has positive relationship with BE.	237
4.12.4 H4: Social media positively moderates the relationship between CPB and BE.	239
4.12.5 H5: Social media negatively moderates the relationship between CCB and BE.	243
4.13 Conclusion	245
CHAPTER 5 CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS	247
5.1 Introduction	247
5.2 Summary of Research Findings	247
5.2.1 Influence of customer participation behaviour on brand equity	248
5.2.2 Influence of customer citizenship behaviour on brand equity.	250

5.2.3	Social media (e-wom) create influence on the brand equity.	251
5.2.4	The impact of social media on the relationship between (CPB) and (BE).	253
5.2.5	The impact of Social media on the relationship between CCB and BE.	254
5.2.6	Research Implications	256
5.2.7	Theoretical Implications	257
5.3	Implications for Research Design	259
5.4	Selection of an Appropriate Construct's Scale	259
5.5	Contextual Implication	260
5.6	Implications in the Context of Pakistan	260
5.7	Implications in the Context of Developing Countries	261
5.8	Practical Implications	262
5.9	Limitations of the Study and Future Research	265
5.10	Chapter Summary	265
	REFERENCES	267
	APPENDIX	330

LIST OF TABLES

	Page
Table 1.1: Events of Frauds and Compensation Paid by Govt	11
Table 1.2: Banks were not hacked, but card detail leaked	11
Table 2.1: Presents the mostly cited studies concerning brand equity	32
Table 2.2: Four main categories of client value	60
Table 2.3: Literature of varying values	62
Table 2.4: Top 5 VCC Research Area categories	65
Table 2.5: Consumer Engagement Definitions of VCC	71
Table 2.6: Different terms are used for Labelling customer-based behaviour	107
Table 3.1: Name of Banks	169
Table 3.2: Selected Banks for Data Collection	170
Table 3.3: Table for Determining Sample Size for a Finite Population	173
Table 3.4: Population of Major Cities	176
Table 3.5: Constructs and Sources	178
Table 3.6: Guidelines for Designing a Questionnaire	180
Table 3.7: Data Characteristics of PLS-SEM	189
Table 3.8: Systematic Process to Perform PLS-SEM	191
Table 3.9: Guidelines for Choosing the Mode of Measurement Model	193
Table 3.10: Steps for Assessing Reflective Measurement Model	194
Table 3.11: Rules of Thumb to Evaluate Reflective Measurement Models	195
Table 3.12: Assessment Procedure for Structural Model	196
Table 3.13: Summary of PLS-SEM Analysis	198

Table 4.1: Data Distribution	208
Table 4.2: Demographic Characteristics	209
Table 4.3: Descriptive Statistics	213
Table 4.4: Correlation Analysis	214
Table 4.5: Internal Consistency Reliability	216
Table 4.6: Outer loadings	219
Table 4.7: Average Variance Extracted (AVE)	221
Table 4.8: Fornell-Larcker Criterion	222
Table 4.9: Heterotrait-Monotrait Ratio	223
Table 4.10: Testing of Direct Effect Hypotheses	225
Table 4.11 Goodness of Fit (GOF)	232
Table 4.12: Result of Hypothesis Testing	232

LIST OF FIGURES

	Page
Figure 2.1: Consumer evaluation of brand extension	37
Figure 2.2: Strategic Brand Management	43
Figure 2.3: CBBE Model	47
Figure 2.4: Value as difference between sacrifices and benefits	59
Figure 2.5: The world's unbanked adults by region	93
Figure 2.6: Adults without bank account	94
Figure 2.7: Stakeholders of Firm	139
Figure 2.8: Model of Customer Value Co-Creation Behaviour	142
Figure 2.9: Proposed Model (Conceptual Framework)	152
Figure 4.1: Chapter Layout	202
Figure: 4.2 Structural Model	226
Figure: 4.3 Structural model (Algorithmic Analysis) PLS-SEM	228
Figure 4.4: Structuralmodel (Bootstrapping) PLS-SEM	229
Figure: 4.5: Moderation effect on the relationship between CPB and BE	230
Figure: 4.6: Moderation effect on the relationship between CCB and BE	231

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

BE	Brand Equity
CCB	Customer Citizenship Behaviour
CPB	Customer Participation Behaviour
CSR	Corporate Social Responsibility
EWOM	Electronic Word of Mouth
FMCG	Fast Moving Consumer Goods
GOVT	Government
ICT	Information and Communication Technology
RMO	Relationship Marketing Orientation
SBP	State Bank of Pakistan
SDL	Service Dominant Logic
SMM	Social Media Marketing
UNIMAS	Universiti Malaysia Sarawak
VCC	Value Co Creation
WOM	Word of Mouth

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

The purpose of this chapter of the thesis is to set the environment for what will follow. The first section presents the study's background and rationale. This section offers a general introduction to the Pakistani banking industry, particularly focusing on and investigating low bankerization with real-time problematic conditions. As a result, it provides context for the research being conducted, including the research questions, objectives, scope, and significance of the study. This section of the study also presents the theoretical background of the study and its practical and contextual implications.

1.1 Research Background

Businesses are starting to recognize the value of their brand names and see them as something like valuable assets (Keller, 2003). According to a Brand Finance (2022), Apple's brand is currently valued at roughly \$355 billion, up 35% from 2021. Amazon is the only firm that comes close, with its \$350 billion brand value putting it comfortably in second place with a 38% gain, and Google comes in third with a \$263 billion brand value. Tiktok is another interesting addition to this list. Tiktok's brand value has increased by a remarkable 215% throughout the company's rapid expansion (Brand Finance, 2022). It has the quickest brand value growth rate of all the companies on this list, which is unsurprising given that Tiktok's user base has soared from 290 million to 655 million in just two years. If this trend continues, Tiktok may be able to reach one billion users by 2025 (Dao et al., 2022). As the above-mentioned statistics show, it is undeniable that brands are becoming increasingly significant and are acknowledged as the most significant asset. Brands are the corporations'

capabilities, allowing them to exceed the market. Moreover, they developed a concept business to expand their market reach and generate future sales (Kapferer, 2012; Dwivedi et al., 2023).

In the current marketing and promotional environment, building a strong brand is more crucial than ever. Branding comprises creating a believable, positive, and long-lasting image of the business that builds a strong connection with customers. The robustness of the company's brand could make such a difference between struggling for awareness and profits and booming as a dynamic, greatest corporate entity. Studies in the field and practices are concerned with establishing an effective bond between the brand and the end user (Shokri & Alavi, 2019; Sichtmann, Davvetas, & Diamantopoulos, 2019).

This argument is particularly pertinent to the larger business sector, which stands out for being global and intensely competitive. Therefore, brands play a crucial role in advertising, and organizations highly value a strong brand as a component. As businesses begin to focus more on the customer than the product, wide-spectrum awareness of the brand appears to be more important than ever (Lückenbach et al., 2023). Whether it's the "priceless" effect on a better future or the ecosystem of friends and family, brands typically emphasize the importance of "balanced competition." It ultimately comes down to human morality, which is a combination of beliefs and values. That ultimately influences people's behaviours and attitudes (Sichtmann et al., 2019). Therefore, a brand is more than a creation, as it can have proportions and be differentiated in some way from some of the other objects created to accomplish the same demands. According to the data provided by the United States Census Bureau (2022), there are many distinct types of businesses that make up the service industry. Warehouse and transport services, information services, securities and

investment services, etc. are all examples of such sectors. The service industry produces intangible products. Warehouse and transport services, information services, securities and investment services, etc. are all examples of such sectors. The service industry manufactures intangible products. In particular, the service industry creates services rather than tangible things. But their services are known as products in the banking sector, such as savings accounts or fixed deposit accounts (Febrian et al., 2023). Services-based economies, rather than industries or agriculture, are considered the most advanced. These adjustments may be more significant, expressive, and intangible in light of the company's beliefs, or they may be consistent as well as tangible in reaction to the product branding (De Chernatony et al., 1998; Araujo et al., 2023).

According to Bronnenberg and Dubé (2017), "brand worth," or the commercial significance of a brand's underlying attribute to the business that maintains the mark, can be a significant and lucrative intangible asset. While it is frequently assumed that brands create necessary entry-level obstacles and ensure sustainable maximum profit, this is not the case (Schmalensee et al., 1986; Vuong, 2023). In practice, the dimensions of brand value are difficult to comprehend. The marketable value of a brand's trademark to the organisation is finally defined in accordance with a counterfactual (Borkovsky, Goldfarb, Haviv, & Moorthy, 2017). Moreover, the notion of brand equity (BE) speaks to the value addition that a particular brand contributes to a company and its products (Yoo, Donthu, & Lee, 2000). In other aspects, it is the "variation impact of brand understanding on customer reaction to promotional campaigns (Keller, 1993). Branding enhances consumer choice by providing a unique marketing aspect that includes elements that may affect consumers based on the brand's proficiencies and trustworthiness (Sasmita & Suki et al., 2015). Brands that have high brand equity (BE) will have larger profit margins, be more successful in their effective