



Faculty of Social Sciences and Humanities

**Effectiveness of Non-Governmental Organizations in Rural Development
in Chitral District, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Province of Pakistan**

Anwar ul Mujahid Shah

**Doctor of Philosophy
2018**

Effectiveness of Non-Governmental Organisations in Rural Development in
Chitral District, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Province of Pakistan

Anwar ul Mujahid Shah

A thesis submitted

In fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

(Urbanization and Community Development)

Faculty of Social Sciences and Humanities
UNIVERSITI MALAYSIA SARAWAK
2018

DECLARATION

I, Anwar ul Mujahid Shah, 15010031, Faculty of Social Sciences and Humanities, hereby declare that the work entitled “Effectiveness of Non-Governmental Organisations in Rural Development in Chitral District, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Province of Pakistan” is my original work. I have not copied from any other student’s work or from any other sources except where due reference or acknowledgment is made explicitly in the text, nor has any part been written for me by another person. The thesis has not been accepted for any degree and is not concurrently submitted in candidature of any other degree.

Signature.....

Name.....

Student Number.....

Date.....

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

Bismillahir-Rahmanir-Rahim in the name of Allah, Most Gracious, Most Compassionate, who gave me the spiritual and physical strength, wisdom and patience to complete this thoughtful and laborious work (Alhamdulillah). First and foremost, I would like to express my sincere and deepest gratitude to my supervisor, Dr. Wong Swee Kiong and co-supervisor Professor Dr. Spencer Empading Sanggin from Universiti Malaysia Sarawak. I consider myself extremely fortunate to have a professional and highly experienced supervisor Dr. Wong Swee Kiong who cared so much about my work, and who responded to my questions and queries so promptly. Her continuous hard work and enthusiasm in research extremely motivated me in my studies. I would like to thank both of my supervisors. I am highly inspired by their guidance and support at every step of my research. I consider and acknowledge them as intellectually humble researchers & truly human beings. Many thanks to Associate Professor Dr. Ahmad Nizar b. Yaakub, for his support and guidance during the study. I also want to express my gratitude to Associate Professor Dr. Neilson Ilan Mersat, Dean of Faculty of Social Sciences and Humanities, for his supportive thoughts, gentleness, humbleness and sympathetic attitude. I would like to express my gratitude to Deputy Dean, Dr. Arnold Puyok for giving his precious time when needed. I am grateful to Madam Norazlina for her support and guidance about the use of library database. Special thanks go to the NGOs staffs and local communities for granting me permission to collect data. I am grateful to the Universiti Malaysia Sarawak, for granting me a scholarship. Lastly, I wish to express my deepest gratitude to my parents for their encouragement and psychological support during my study.

ABSTRACT

The present study has been focusing towards determining the effectiveness of the NGOs in making a difference in the development of Pakistan rural areas particularly considering Chitral province from the community approach. This research intended to examine how NGOs in Chitral apply community approach for the rural development of Chitral particularly by focusing on Ayun and Yarkhun Union Councils. The present research used a case study research design and ethnographic qualitative approach by focusing on the directly observable material items to notice the entire education, health and gender equality in Chitral after the entry of NGOs. In order to collect appropriate data, three key tools were selected, including observations, Focus Group Discussion (FGD), and In-depth Interviews (IDI). Purposive sampling method was used to select a total of 152 informants from the two councils of Chitral, Ayun, and Yarkhun for data collection where 64 informants from each council were selected for FGDs and 12 for IDIs. The number of the sample was subject to saturation point. The snow ball sampling was used to reach out the various informants in the study. The data were analyzed using open coding method and thematic analysis. The results of the study have indicated that the NGOs (particularly AKRSP and SRSP functioning in Ayun and Yarkhun Councils of Chitral, respectively) are primarily applying community approach by focusing on different factors. For instance, the major ways or activities followed to implement community approach within the identified regions are involving local people and staff members in every activity and/or even in decision-making process to know about their needs. NGOs in Chitral have been trying to make education compulsory for both genders, besides improving health awareness and facilities in the hospitals, and promoting gender equality through effective actions, including campaigns and workshops. The research further explored that the activities

adopted by NGOs in these councils assessed by the communities were found to perform effectively in informing people regarding the importance of high education, improved health and gender empowerment without which the rural development (high standard of living) is not possible. The study depicted that the entry of NGOs in Chitral has been accepted through implementing projects, which are influential in making significant contributions to bring positive changes to the communities. Thus, these organisations are suggested to take some rational actions to aware people through cost-benefit analysis who are less interested in participating the rural development. The research had indicated that for the issues encountered in the case of community approach, awareness and understanding should be increased for rural development in a more holistic way. On the contrary, the contemplated study further showed some research limitations, such as lack of mixed method. Thus, it is recommended for future researchers to employ a mixed method on a similar study.

Keywords: Rural development, non-governmental organisations, effectiveness, community approach, Chitral

Keberkesanan Badan Bukan kerajaan(NGOs) dalam Pembangunan Luar Bandar di Daerah Chitral, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan

ABSTRAK

Kajian ini telah memberikan tumpuan terhadap penentuan keberkesanan pihak NGO dalam pembangunan kawasan pedalaman dalam membawa kepada perubahan di wilayah Chitral, Pakistan dengan menggunakan pendekatan masyarakat. Kajian ini bertujuan untuk menilai bagaimana NGO di Chitral menerapkan pendekatan masyarakat untuk pembangunan luar bandar terutamanya dengan memberi tumpuan kepada Majlis Kesatuan Ayun dan Yarkhun. Kajian ini dijalankan berdasarkan kajian kes dan pendekatan kualitatif etnografi dengan bertumpukan kepada pemerhatian bahan-bahan yang boleh dilihat secara langsung untuk mendapatkan gambaran secara menyeluruh terhadap taraf pendidikan, kesihatan, dan kesaksamaan gender di Chitral selepas kewujudan NGO. Tiga teknik pengumpulan data secara kualitatif telah dipilih iaitu kaedah pemerhatian, kaedah perbincangan kumpulan berfokus (FGD), dan temu bual mendalam (IDI). Kaedah persampelan bertujuan (purposive sampling method) digunakan untuk memilih seramai 152 informan daripada Majlis Kesatuan Ayun dan Yarkhun di Daerah Chitral, di mana 64 informan dari setiap majlis kesatuan telah dipilih untuk terlibat dalam FGD dan 12 telah dipilih untuk IDI. Bilangan sampel tertakluk kepada titik tepu (saturation point). Kaedah persampelan rantai (snow ball) digunakan untuk mengenalpasti informan dalam kajian ini. Data telah dianalisis dengan menggunakan cara pengkodan terbuka (open coding method) dan analisis tematik. Hasil dapatan kajian menunjukkan bahawa NGO (terutamanya AKRSP dan SRSP yang berfungsi di Majlis Kesatuan Ayun dan Yarkhun di Chitral) secara umumnya menerapkan pendekatan masyarakat dengan memfokuskan pada faktor yang berbeza. Sebagai contoh, cara atau

aktiviti utama yang diikuti untuk melaksanakan pendekatan komuniti adalah dengan melibatkan penduduk tempatan dan kakitangan dalam setiap aktiviti dan/atau dalam proses membuat keputusan untuk mengenal pasti keperluan mereka. Pendidikan diwajibkan tanpa mengira jantina, meningkatkan kesedaran kesihatan dan kemudahan seperti hospital, serta memupuk kesaksamaan gender melalui tindakan berkesan seperti kempen dan bengkel kesedaran. Kajian ini juga mendapati bahawa aktiviti-aktiviti yang diadakan oleh NGO dalam majlis-majlis kesatuan ini adalah berkesan dalam meningkatkan kesedaran masyarakat terhadap pendidikan tinggi, peningkatan taraf kesihatan serta kesaksamaan gender dalam komuniti yang merupakan elemen penting dalam pembangunan luar bandar untuk mencapai taraf hidup yang lebih tinggi. Kajian ini menggambarkan bahawa kemasukan NGO di Chitral telah diterima baik melalui pelaksanaan projek yang berpengaruh dalam memberi sumbangan penting untuk membawa perubahan positif. Oleh itu, organisasi-organisasi ini dicadangkan untuk mengambil tindakan holistik melalui analisis kos-faedah untuk memberi kesedaran kepada orang yang kurang berminat untuk menyertai pembangunan luar bandar. Kajian ini menunjukkan bahawa kesedaran dan pemahaman perlu ditingkatkan bagi isu-isu yang dihadapi dalam kes pendekatan masyarakat untuk pembangunan luar bandar ke arah yang lebih baik. Beberapa batasan penyelidikan, seperti kurangnya pendekatan campuran (mixed method) digunakan. Oleh itu, adalah disyorkan supaya kajian masa depan menggunakan kaedah campuran bagi kajian yang sama.

Kata kunci: *Pembangunan luar bandar, badan bukan kerajaan, keberkesanan, pendekatan komuniti, Chitral.*

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
DECLARATION	i
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	ii
ABSTRACT	iii
ABSTRAK	v
TABLE OF CONTENTS	vii
LIST OF TABLES	xv
LIST OF FIGURES	xvi
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xvii
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Background.....	1
1.2 Gaps in Existing Literature.....	9
1.3 Problem Statement.....	13
1.4 Research Questions	18
1.5 General Objective	19
1.6 Specific Objectives	19
1.7 Significance of the Research	19
1.8 Operational Definitions	25
1.8.1 Rural Development	25
1.8.2 Non-governmental Organisations (NGOs)	27
1.8.3 Effectiveness	27
1.8.4 Community Approach.....	28
1.9 Overview of the Study	28

CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW.....	30
2.1 Introduction.....	30
2.2 Concept of Development	31
2.3 Rural Development and Its Importance.....	33
2.4 Rural Development Approaches.....	38
2.4.1 Sectoral Approach.....	39
2.4.2 Multisectoral Approach	40
2.4.3 Territorial Approach.....	40
2.4.4 Local Approach	41
2.5 Selected Rural Development Approach.....	41
2.6 Community Approaches	43
2.6.1 Social Capital Approach.....	45
2.6.2 Non-violent Direction Approach.....	45
2.6.3 Economic Development Approach	46
2.6.4 Community Economic Development Approach	47
2.6.5 Sustainable Development Approach	47
2.6.6 Community Driven Development Approach.....	47
2.6.7 Community Organising Approach.....	48
2.7 Participatory Rural Appraisal (PRA).....	48
2.8 Rapid Rural Appraisal (RRA)	51
2.9 Selected Community Approach.....	53
2.9.1 Beneficiary Consultation Approach	53
2.9.2 Approach of Engagement of NGOs	56
2.10 Role of NGOs	58

2.10.1	Development of Infrastructure.....	59
2.10.2	Supporting Innovation and Pilot Projects.....	60
2.10.3	Facilitating Communication	60
2.10.4	Support and Counselling Programmes.....	61
2.10.5	Technical Assistance and Training	61
2.10.6	Research, Monitoring, and Consideration	62
2.10.7	Advocacy in Case of the Poor	62
2.11	Classification of NGOs.....	64
2.12	Types of NGOs by Orientation.....	64
2.12.1	Empowering Orientation	65
2.12.2	Service Orientation	65
2.12.3	Charitable Orientation.....	66
2.12.4	Participatory Orientation.....	67
2.13	Types of NGOs by Level of Operation.....	68
2.13.1	International NGOs	68
2.13.2	National NGOs	69
2.13.3	Citywide Organisations	69
2.13.4	Community-based Organisations (CBOs).....	70
2.14	NGOs-led Rural Development	71
2.15	Overview of NGOs in Pakistan	78
2.15.1	Education Sector in Pakistan.....	81
2.15.2	Health Sector in Pakistan.....	83
2.15.3	Women Empowerment in Pakistan.....	86
2.16	Overview of NGOs Effectiveness in the World	88

2.16.1	Education Sector.....	89
2.16.2	Health Sector	91
2.16.3	Women Empowerment	92
2.17	Chapter Summary	94
 CHAPTER 3: CASE STUDY OF CHITRAL DISTRICT KHYBER		
PAKHTUNKHWA, PAKISTAN.....		
98		
3.1	Introduction to Pakistan.....	98
3.2	Introduction to Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KPK).....	100
3.3	Introduction to Chitral District, KPK	101
3.4	Why Case Study of Chitral	104
3.5	NGOs Operating in Chitral General Overview	107
3.6	Agha Khan Rural Support Programme (AKRSP) Vision, Mission and Role	108
3.7	Sarhad Rural Support Programme (SRSP) Vision, Mission and Role	111
3.8	Community Participation Model or Approaches used by AKRSP and SRSP.....	113
3.8.1	Agha Khan Rural Support Programme (AKRSP) Community Participation Model.....	114
3.8.2	Sarhad Rural Support Programme (SRSP) Community Participation Model.....	117
3.9	Conclusion.....	118
 CHAPTER 4: THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK.....		
120		
4.1	Introduction.....	120
4.2	Community Development Theory	120
4.3	Empowerment Theory	122
4.4	Participation Theory	124

4.5	Frame of Analysis.....	128
4.6	Chapter Summary	129
CHAPTER 5: METHODOLOGY.....		132
5.1	Introduction.....	132
5.2	Location of Target Areas	132
	5.2.1 Residents of Chitral	133
5.3	Research Philosophy.....	134
5.4	Case-Study (Research Design)	136
5.5	Sampling and Sample Size	137
5.6	Sampling Procedure.....	139
5.7	Socio-demographic Data	140
5.8	Inclusion and Exclusion Criteria	142
5.9	Ethnographic Research Approach	143
5.10	Tools for Data Collection	144
5.11	Observations	144
5.12	Focus Group Discussion (FGD)	145
5.13	In-Depth Interview (IDI)	145
5.14	Pilot Study	146
5.15	Pre-field Activities.....	147
5.16	Procedure Fieldwork.....	147
5.17	Assumptions	150
5.18	Ethical Considerations	151
5.19	Truth Worthies and Dependability (Validity and Reliability).....	152
	5.19.1 Credibility.....	152

5.19.2	Dependability	153
5.19.3	Transferability	153
5.19.4	Confirmability	153
5.20	Field Challenges and How to Overcome	154
5.21	Data Analysis and Management	155
5.21.1	Transcription and Translation.....	155
5.22	Coding and Analysis	156
5.22.1	NGOs' Ways of Adopting Community Approach for Rural Development of Chitral	157
5.22.2	Effectiveness of NGOs in Improving Education, Health and Women Empowerment.....	159
5.23	Conclusion.....	160
CHAPTER 6: FINDING AND DISCUSSION.....		162
6.1	Introduction.....	162
6.2	NGOs' Ways of Adopting Community Approach for Rural Development in Chitral.....	163
6.3	Increasing Community Participation	165
6.4	Involvement of Local Citizens and NGOs' Staff	165
6.5	Increase in Income at Individual Level for Low Poverty	171
6.6	Employment Opportunities.....	171
6.7	Convinced or Sceptical for Compulsory Education	173
6.8	High Ratio of School Registration and Cost-effective Education	174
6.9	Sceptical about NGOs.....	175
6.10	Social Awareness and Facilities/Training for Health Improvements	176

6.11	Access to Medicines and Other Health Related Facilities.....	177
6.12	Participation of Women through Women Organisations (WOs) and Village Organisations (VOs).....	178
6.13	Efficient Allocation of Labour Resources	179
6.14	Summary of Discussion.....	182
6.15	Effectiveness of NGOs in Implementing Project for the Improvement of Education, Health and Women Empowerment	182
6.16	Responsive Involvement of NGOs in Implementing Rural Development Projects/Programmes	183
6.17	Activities Undertaken By NGOs' Staff Members with the Help of Local Citizens.....	183
6.18	Alignment with Educational Strategies	184
6.19	Projects Satisfying Educational Needs of Society.....	185
6.20	The Lack of Having a Predetermined Education Programmes.....	187
6.21	Dissemination: Awareness along with Operations for Wellbeing.....	189
6.22	Success in Teaching, Training, or Facilitating Local Individuals	189
6.23	Unorganized Long-Term and Short-Term Plans for Continuous Improvement....	193
6.24	Accessible and Equitable Opportunities for Women to be Empowered	194
6.25	Build Self-Sustaining Environment and Culture of Women Freedom	194
6.26	Gender Equality	199
6.27	Overall Sustainability of Project in the Community.....	203
6.28	Summary of Discussion.....	207
6.29	Chapter Summary	210

CHAPTER 7: SUMMARY, CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....	213
7.1 Introduction.....	213
7.2 Summary.....	214
7.3 Contributions to the Knowledge.....	216
7.4 Future Implications of the Study	218
7.5 Strengths and Limitations of the Study	219
7.6 Recommendations.....	220
REFERENCES	223
APPENDICES... ..	271

LIST OF TABLES

	Page
Table 5.1 Distribution of Informants	138
Table 5.2 Distribution of Informant by Union Council.....	140
Table 5.3 Demographic and Social Characteristics of Focus Group Informants	141
Table 5.4 Occupation of In-Depth Interview Informants	141
Table 5.5 Demographic & Social Characteristics of In-Depth Interview Informants....	142
Table 5.6 NGOs' Ways of Adopting Community Approach	158
Table 5.7 Effectiveness of NGOs in Education, Health and Women Empowerment	159

LIST OF FIGURES

	Page
Figure 3.1 Location of Pakistan by World Map	99
Figure 3.2 Failure of Government Model for Community Rural Development.....	114
Figure 3.3 Cooperative Model with Community Participation	116
Figure 3.4 Manipulative Model with Participation	117
Figure 3.5 Three-tier Model with Participation.....	118
Figure 4.1 Ladder of Citizen Participation.....	127
Figure 4.2 Frame of Analysis (Based on Selected Theories)	129
Figure 5.1 Map of Chitral.....	133

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AIDS	Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome (AIDS)
AKRSP	Agha Khan Rural Support Programme
BN	Basic Need Approach
BIDP	Broz Integrated Development Programme
CD	Community Development
CIADP	Chitral Integrated Area Development Programme
CED	Community Economic Development
CDD	Community Driven Development
CESVI	Cooperazione e Sviluppo Onlus
CIADO	Chitral Integrated Area Development Organisation
CAD	Creative Approaches Development
FIDA	Foundation for Integrated Development Action
FGD	Focus Group Discussion
HIV	Human Immunodeficiency Virus
IRD	Integrated Rural Development
IDI	In-Depth Interview
ICDP	Integrated Chitral Development Programme
KPK	Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
LSO	Local Support Organisations
MNA	Member of National Assembly
N.W.F.P	North-West Frontier Province
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
PPAF	Pakistan Poverty Alleviation Fund

PRA	Participatory Rural Appraisal
PSC	Poverty Score Card
RDP	Reconstruction and Development Programme
RRA	Rapid Rural Appraisal
SAP	Structural Adjustment Programme
SRSP	Sarhad Rural Support Programme
TADO	Terich Area Development Organisation
UC	Union Council
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Funds
VO	Village Organisation
WASEP	Water and Sanitation Extension Programme
WO	Women Organisation
YMC	Young Men's Christian Association
YWCAS	Young Women's Christian Association
YSDO	Young Star Development Organisation

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background

The concept of development is comparatively complicated and scholars have identified differing versions of developmental concepts. Development as a notion is defined as the positive change or improvement in any concept, discovery/invention, design or region in terms of advancement in infrastructure or community betterment (Scott & Storper, 2003; Maton, 2008). Considering the evolution of this word's definition after modernization, it was found by researchers and professionals that development is majorly allied to the globalization (Avolio & Gardner, 2005). This is because globalization favours interconnectedness through massively increased trade and cultural exchange that requires further progress at every level (local and global) to bring people closer and to meet their needs. It implies that development simply is a broad concept that covers all the needs at small and large scales and recommended actions for bringing a positive change in the form of making a thing/nation more advanced. Conversely, rural development, as per social scientists, is a sub-concept of the development process that has been purely defined as the procedure, which particularly develops quality living standards and self-reliance within rural communities (living isolated) through inclusive and participatory measures (Schech & Haggis, 2008).

Rural development is a commonly used term referred while denoting to developing or underdeveloped countries as a procedure that enhances the capacity of production and increases the living standards within rural or suburban areas (Kis, Gal, & Véha, 2012; Roka, 2012). Rural development is defined as the process, which is multidimensional and

designed for envisioning the improvement variety necessary for the progress of rural life. Rural development in most cases entails the betterment of quality of life of the individuals living in suburban places along with the economic well-being based on sustainability (Moseley, 2003). Thereof, it is considered as an imperative process according to several researchers (Russell & Nicholson, 2016). The development of the rural areas was initiated with the shocking insight of the fact the international development strategies do not support the poor in any country (Chambers, 2014). This inability resulted in the difference of income distribution by increasing the numbers of the poor people in the world's developing countries (Scott & Storper, 2003).

Moreover, the standard of living was also affected by the increase in poverty ratio, as rural inhabitants have no resources of generating income, meeting their basic needs of food, water and house and treating their health issues/diseases. This condition highlighted the needs of rural development by the civil society in different nations (Issa & Faisal, 2004; Viriya, 2009). The combination of the state and the society is called the civil society (Nayar, 2008). The state has responsibilities of managing and efficiently allocating resource and public goods, which is distributed through the concerned authorities within the community group or is distributed, based on the society' defined common goods, and resources by values and visions (Norton, 1995; Kabeer, 2010). If these responsibilities of states are not fulfilled in a rural development, then there is a need for rural development with the help of other firms.

Different society arenas including the self-organized group of citizens, associations, social movements, and philanthropic associations, therefore formulate the civil society on their own where all the resources are fairly and efficiently allocated (Brown &

Kalegaonkar, 2000; Fioramonti & Thümler, 2013). However, the new development paradigms of the rural development include the involvement of non-profit sector or Non-governmental organisations (NGOs) (Stamoulis & Zezza, 2003). This is because NGOs' contributions are relatively high to formulate a civil society in developing regions. NGOs are voluntary organisations considered as a substitute for the provider of social services. They work for the betterment and improvement of the lives of underprivileged people. NGOs favor the governance policies for the elimination of hunger and poverty. Although NGOs have been observed to offer immense services in terms of rural development; however, in numerous nations, the results have been apparent to be inadequate in terms of the essential services provided to poor people of the rural areas (Siddiqui, 2004; World Bank, 2004). This happened because numerous challenges have been encountered in rural areas while supporting the activities that could provide long-term solutions to the issues of hunger and poverty (Ayinagadda, 2013).

According to Coate, Handmer & Choong (2006), if these constraints are not faced by NGOs and they are supported to be entered in rural regions, then they could assist in improving the standard of living of rural inhabitants (who mostly have agriculture only as their source of income). This is because, NGOs work for development through advanced education system to improve awareness regarding gender equality, infrastructural development (roads construction to lessen market distance for villagers to sell agricultural products and increase earnings, and construct hospital for health improvements by raising awareness of chronic and other diseases, such as HIV& AIDS) (Coate et al., 2006). Conversely, rural development in underdeveloped countries is majorly based on the natural resource's exploitation including the forestry and agriculture; while urbanization and globalization of countries have affected this process badly by changing the rural

development fundamentals (Ison & Russell, 2007; Oliver & Jacobs, 2007). This situation tends NGOs to select the best approaches in order to focus on any rural area for development by differentiating their needs and available resources. Presently, NGOs in different developing countries of the world adopt various methods or approaches, but the participation approach (also called community approach) is most adaptable. Participation approach is the process that includes rural inhabitants in the activities that take place and gives an opportunity to them to share their source of income, necessities and need of rural development to notice to what extent natural resources' exploitation is essential and to what extent urbanization has been followed within the society. The acceleration of adopting the participation approach of NGOs has been initiated from the 1970s in most developing and/or decentralized countries, including Jordan and Zimbabwe (Moyo, 2012).

The associated themes and theories that are used by the NGOs are adopted with an aim to entail the communities in the rural development projects (Chambers, 2012). The adoption of different approaches, including participation approach by the NGOs has been considered as the source of providing effective rural development. Since for instance in the case of Zimbabwe, NGOs provided all services in rural communities and facilitated development projects after failing its government (Moyo, 2012). Researchers similar to Ellis & Biggs (2001) who have been studying the methodologies, approaches, and themes followed by the NGOs since the 1950s, highlight that while considering the numerous amounts of policy thrusts, themes, and approaches that have been used and been observed to be instrumental, importance of participation approach is inescapable for rural development.